To: Gillis, Chris[Gillis.Chris@epa.gov]; Dinkins, Darlene[Dinkins.Darlene@epa.gov]; Sisco,

Debby[Sisco.Debby@epa.gov]; Strauss, Linda[Strauss.Linda@epa.gov]; Fehrenbach,

Margie[Fehrenbach.Margie@epa.gov]

Cc: Han, Kaythi[Han.Kaythi@epa.gov]; Riggs, Rebecca[Riggs.Rebecca@epa.gov]; Overstreet,

Anne[overstreet.anne@epa.gov]; Coleman, Delphine[Coleman.Delphine@epa.gov]

From: Jordan, William

Sent: Tue 7/1/2014 9:47:09 PM

Subject: RE: DUE ASAP: Green wire asking for a timeline for Endangered Species Act assessment

This response is about all we can say at this point. There needs to be a "be" before "focused" in the last sentence.

Thanks,

Bill

William Jordan

Deputy Director, Programs

Office of Pesticide Programs

U. S. Environmental Protection Agency

Phone: 703-305-1049

Fax: 703-308-4776

Mailing Address: Courier Address:

USEPA Headquaters Potomac Yards South

Clinton Building 2777 Crystal Drive

1200 Pennsylvania Ave., NW Room 12-235

Mail Code (7501P) Arlington, VA

Washington, DC 20460

From: Gillis, Chris

Sent: Tuesday, July 01, 2014 5:16 PM

To: Dinkins, Darlene; Sisco, Debby; Strauss, Linda; Jordan, William; Fehrenbach, Margie

Cc: Han, Kaythi; Riggs, Rebecca; Overstreet, Anne; Coleman, Delphine

Subject: DUE ASAP: Green wire asking for a timeline for Endangered Species Act assessment

Linda, Bill and Margie – have you cleared response below? Darlene sent it this morning in the email below. Press office asking for our response asap

Media Outlet: Greenwire; Reporter: Tiffany Stecker

Topic: Enlist Duo – Timeline for ESA Assessment

Due: 10a.m. 01 July 2014

Reporter's Question:

I'm writing a story on the proposal to register Enlist Duo 2,4-D herbicide for six states. As I understand it, these are the states in which EPA made a "no effects" determination for endangered species.

I'd like to know if there is a timeline for Endangered Species Act assessment for other states.

EPA Response:

Deliberative

For more information on the registration of Enlist Duo 2,4-D, see http://www.epa.gov/pesticides/factsheets/2-4-d-glyphosate.html.

Thank you,

Chris

Chris (Christine) Gillis, Public Affairs Specialist

Office of Chemical Safety and Pollution Prevention

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

202-564-0190

www.epa.gov/safepestcontrol | www.epa.gov/greenchemistry | www.epa.gov/dfe/saferingredients http://blog.epa.gov | http://twitter.com/greenversations | http://www.epa.gov/newsroom

From: Dinkins, Darlene

Sent: Tuesday, July 01, 2014 2:24 PM

To: Sisco, Debby; Strauss, Linda; Gillis, Chris; Overstreet, Anne; Coleman, Delphine

Cc: Han, Kaythi; Riggs, Rebecca; Fehrenbach, Margie

Subject: RE: Green wire asking for a timeline for Endangered Species Act assessment

See below.

From: Riggs, Rebecca

Sent: Tuesday, July 01, 2014 8:23 AM

To: Rosenblatt, Daniel

Cc: Han, Kaythi; Dinkins, Darlene; Pease, Anita; Kenny, Daniel; Montague, Kathryn V.; Hendricks,

Kristen

Subject: PRESS INQUIRY - RE: Green wire asking for a timeline for Endangered Species Act

assessment - Due ASAP!!!

Importance: High

Good morning Dan – We received a press inquiry late yesterday regarding the timeline for ESA assessments for Enlist Duo. Anita Pease has concurred on the response below (her note is in the string below) but she wanted RD to also weigh in on the response. This is due 10a.m. this morning.

Media Outlet: Greenwire; Reporter: Tiffany Stecker

Topic: Enlist Duo – Timeline for ESA Assessment

Due: 10a.m. 01 July 2014

Reporter's Question:

I'm writing a story on the proposal to register Enlist Duo 2,4-D herbicide for six states. As I understand it, these are the states in which EPA made a "no effects" determination for endangered species.

I'd like to know if there is a timeline for Endangered Species Act assessment for other states.

EPA Response:

Deliberative

Deliberative

For more information on the registration of Enlist Duo 2,4-D, see http://www.epa.gov/pesticides/factsheets/2-4-d-glyphosate.html.

From: Kenny, Daniel

Sent: Tuesday, July 01, 2014 1:33 PM **To:** Rosenblatt, Daniel; Dinkins, Darlene

Subject: RE: PRESS INQUIRY - RE: Green wire asking for a timeline for Endangered Species Act

assessment - Due ASAP!!!

Deliberative

From: Rosenblatt, Daniel

Sent: Tuesday, July 01, 2014 1:21 PM

To: Dinkins, Darlene **Cc:** Kenny, Daniel

Subject: Re: PRESS INQUIRY - RE: Green wire asking for a timeline for Endangered Species

Act assessment - Due ASAP!!!

Darlene - I slipped it under Dan Kenny's door - but I know he's awfully busy too.

From: Sisco, Debby

Sent: Tuesday, July 01, 2014 2:14 PM

To: Dinkins, Darlene; Strauss, Linda; Gillis, Chris; Overstreet, Anne; Coleman, Delphine

Cc: Han, Kaythi; Riggs, Rebecca; Fehrenbach, Margie

Subject: RE: Green wire asking for a timeline for Endangered Species Act assessment

What is our answer?

Debby Sisco

Office of Pesticide Programs (7501P)
Ethics Officer and Special Assistant to the Director
Room 12651 Potomac Yard South --- (703 308-8121)

From: Dinkins, Darlene

Sent: Tuesday, July 01, 2014 1:56 PM

To: Milbourn, Cathy; Strauss, Linda; Gillis, Chris; Overstreet, Anne; Sisco, Debby; Coleman,

Delphine

Cc: Han, Kaythi; Riggs, Rebecca

Subject: RE: Green wire asking for a timeline for Endangered Species Act assessment

Looks like this story ran already. We sent a prepared response to EFED and RD for approval yesterday; however, RD management was pretty tied-up in meetings most of the day today. I just received their approval. (see the incoming inquiry below).

http://www.eenews.net/greenwire/2014/07/01/stories/1060002232

EPA gets an earful on proposed registration of 'superweed' herbicide

 $\textit{Tiffany Stecker}, E\&E\ reporter$

Published: Tuesday, July 1, 2014

U.S. EPA is plowing through more than 27,000 public comments on the registration of Enlist Duo, an herbicide aimed at the growing number of resistant weeds on cropland.

Developed by Dow AgroSciences, the herbicide is made from a choline salt of 2,4-D and

glyphosate -- the main ingredient in Monsanto's Roundup herbicide. It would help farmers cope with "superweeds," plants that have evolved to withstand applications of glyphosate.

While EPA is mulling approval of the herbicide, the Agriculture Department is considering the deregulation of genetically engineered corn and soybeans that wouldn't be affected by spraying Enlist Duo.

Several farms groups, including the American Farm Bureau Federation, vouched support for Enlist Duo, a solution to the headache of weeds that have evolved to resist glyphosate alone. In Arkansas, growers have been struggling with pigweed, said Andrew Grobmyer, executive vice president of the Agricultural Council of Arkansas.

"As you may know, farmers in our region are challenged with tough weeds that have developed resistance to many chemical applications and seed products currently on the market," Grobmyer wrote. "As a result, farmers are looking for options that will provide new weed management tools."

The proposed registration would only apply to six states where EPA found no effects of the herbicide on endangered species -- Illinois, Indiana, Iowa, Ohio, South Dakota and Wisconsin. Some agriculture groups encouraged the agency to expand the registration to other regions.

"Our members, in Delaware and Maryland, are concerned with weed resistance. We urge EPA to quickly expand this registration to all U.S. corn and soybean production areas," wrote Lindsay Dodd, government relations advocate at the Delaware/Maryland Agribusiness Association.

The Farm Bureau also questioned EPA's allowance of a single nozzle to spray Enlist Duo. The special nozzle is required to lower spray drift to plants that don't need the herbicide, according to the proposal. This would be an unnecessary burden to farmers wrote Dale Moore, director of public policy for the farm bureau.

"Farmers have choices of several nozzles in the market place that achieve the same droplet size, spray pattern and reductions in off-target movement," he wrote. "These producers should not be required to purchase a particular brand of nozzle for use with only one product."

The EPA proposal says additional states may be added to the labeling once an assessment finds that there are no effects on endangered species in a particular state.

Environmental groups are fighting to prevent the registration of Enlist Duo, which they say will increase the use of toxic herbicides while only providing a short-term solution to the problem of resistant weeds.

Weeds no longer respond to traditional pest controls like Roundup because genetically engineered Roundup Ready crops approved in the 1990s allowed certain resistance traits to thrive through evolution, the Environmental Working Group (EWG) writes in its comments.

"It is inevitable that this technology, too, would be used to such an excess that weeds would

rapidly acquire resistance to 2,4-D as well, a pattern known as the 'pesticide treadmill' when farmers end up using larger amounts of increasingly toxic chemicals to control herbicide resistant weeds," EWG says.

The Natural Resources Defense Council <u>criticized</u> the rulemaking for not considering any new assessment on glyphosate, a substance they say has seen a 10-fold increase in use since it was registered in 1993 and has contributed to the decline of monarch butterflies. EPA also did not adequately assess the health impacts of 2,4-D, which can disrupt hormonal function, and does not address well enough the effects of the substance in drinking water and spray drift.

EPA ignores research linking exposure to 2,4-D to cancer, Parkinson's disease and other harms, the Center for Food Safety wrote.

"Approval of these crops and pesticides would set American agriculture down a dangerous path that will only exacerbate the problems farmers are already facing," said Bill Freese, science policy analyst at the Center for Food Safety.

Even the popular energy bar company Clif Bar pitched in, saying that spraying of Enlist Duo could drift to organic farms, compromising the certification of the crops.

"There is a ripple effect; when farmers suffer crop damage from drift our business suffers, either through a shortage of organic ingredients and/or increased cost of ingredients," wrote Matthew Dillon, manager of Clif Bar's agricultural policy and programs division. More than 70 percent of the ingredients sourced by the company are certified organic.

The herbicide 2,4-D is approved for use in more than 70 countries worldwide, including Canada, the United Kingdom, Germany, France, Japan and Australia, said Garry Hamlin, a spokesman for Dow AgroSciences. Regulatory and health organizations have found "little concern" for negative effects when the product is used as directed, he added.

EPA will review comments over the next few weeks and issue a final determination. Dow AgroSciences expects to launch Enlist corn and soybeans next year.

<u>Click here</u> to read the proposed rule and comments.

From: Milbourn, Cathy Sent: Monday, June 30, 2014 5:19 PM To: Strauss, Linda; Gillis, Chris; Overstreet, Anne; Sisco, Debby; Coleman, Delphine; Dinkins, Darlene Cc: Milbourn, Cathy Subject: Green wire asking for a timeline for Endangered Species Act assessment **OUTLET:** Greenwire ISSUE: a timeline for Endangered Species Act assessment DEADLINE: 10:00 am tomorrow Hi Cathy, Hope you're doing well. Don't know if I told you already, but I'm now on the Greenwire side covering agriculture. I'm writing a story on the proposal to register Enlist Duo 2,4-D herbicide for six states. As I understand it, these are the states in which EPA made a "no effects" determination for endangered species. I'd like to know if there is a timeline for Endangered Species Act assessment for other states. Deadline is tomorrow at 10 am. Thanks! **Tiffany**

Tiffany Stecker

Reporter, Greenwire

Personal Privacy

tstecker@eenews.net

Catherine C. Milbourn

U.S. EPA HQ

Office of the Administrator

Office of Media Relations

202-564-7849 (office)

202-420-8648 (mobile)

Milbourn.cathy@epa.gov